



**THE STATES assembled on Wednesday  
4th December 2013, at 09.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of the Deputy Bailiff,  
William James Bailhache, Esquire.**

---

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Sir Philip Martin Bailhache – excused attendance (arrived in the Chamber at 10.30 a.m.)  
Connétable John Martin Refault of St. Peter – en défaut  
Deputy Shona Pitman of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.56 a.m.)  
Deputy Trevor Mark Pitman of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 10.29 a.m.)  
Deputy James Patrick Gorton Baker of St. Helier – absent on States’ business  
Deputy Kristina Louise Moore of St. Peter – ill

---

Prayers

---

**Documents presented or laid**

Long-Term Care Scheme (S.R.11/2013): response of the Minister for Social Security. S.R.11/2013.  
Presented: 4th December 2013. Res.  
*Minister for Social Security.*

**Draft Budget Statement 2014 P.122/2013**

THE STATES resumed consideration of the Draft Budget Statement 2014 (P.122/2013), and rejected paragraph (e) of an amendment of Deputy John Hilary Young of St. Brelade (P.122/2013 (Amendment 4)) that in paragraph (a) of the Budget Statement 2014, after the words “as set out in the Budget Statement” there should be inserted the words –

- “(e) the estimate of income from taxation during 2014 shall be decreased by £1,000,000 by zero-rating or exempting from Goods and Services Tax from 1st July 2014 any expenditure on the installation and maintenance of energy conservation measures (including plant, equipment and materials) from local suppliers and contractors;”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 14**

Senator A. Breckon  
Connétable of St. John  
Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)  
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
Deputy of Grouville  
Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)

**CONTRE: 33**

Senator P.F. Routier  
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
Senator S.C. Ferguson  
Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
Senator I.J. Gorst  
Senator L.J. Farnham  
Senator P.M. Bailhache  
Connétable of St. Helier

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)	Connétable of Trinity
Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)	Connétable of St. Clement
Deputy J.H. Young (B)	Connétable of St. Lawrence
Deputy of St. Mary	Connétable of St. Mary
	Connétable of St. Ouen
	Connétable of St. Brelade
	Connétable of St. Martin
	Connétable of St. Saviour
	Connétable of Grouville
	Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
	Deputy of St. Ouen
	Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
	Deputy of Trinity
	Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
	Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
	Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
	Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
	Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
	Deputy of St. John
	Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
	Deputy of St. Martin
	Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)
	Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)

THE STATES rejected paragraph (f) of an amendment of Deputy John Hilary Young of St. Brelade (P.122/2013 (Amendment 4)) that in paragraph (a) of the Budget Statement 2014, after the words “as set out in the Budget Statement” there should be inserted the words –

- “(f) the estimate of income from taxation during 2014 shall be decreased by £200,000 by zero-rating from Goods and Services Tax from 1st July 2014 on the purchasing, importation and leasing of Ultra Low Emission vehicles (vehicles falling within the definition of the UK Office for Low Emission Vehicles, currently an emission level below 75g/Km of CO<sub>2</sub>);”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 19**

Senator A. Breckon  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisser (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)

**CONTRE: 28**

Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator P.M. Bailhache  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Brelade

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy J.H. Young (B)	Connétable of St. Martin
Deputy of St. Mary	Connétable of Grouville
Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)	Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)	Deputy of Trinity
	Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
	Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
	Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
	Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
	Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
	Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
	Deputy of St. John
	Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
	Deputy of St. Martin

THE STATES commenced an amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier (P.122/2013 (Amendment 2)) that in paragraph (a) of the Budget Statement 2014, after the words “as set out in the Budget Statement” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the estimate of income from taxation during 2014 shall be decreased –

- (i) by £989,000 by increasing duty on all categories of alcohol by the June 2013 RPI figure of 1.5% and not by the percentages proposed in the Draft Budget Statement;
- (ii) by £866,000 by increasing duty on all tobacco products by 4.5% (being the June 2013 RPI figure of 1.5% plus 3%) and not by 11% as proposed in the Draft Budget Statement;
- (iii) by £100,000 by increasing duty on fuel by the June 2013 RPI figure of 1.5% and not by 2% as proposed in the Draft Budget Statement;”.

THE STATES rejected paragraph (i) of an amendment of Deputy Sean Seamus Patrick Augustine Power of St. Brelade (P.122/2013 (Amendment 2)(Amendment)) to the amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier, that for the words “£989,000 by increasing duty on all categories of alcohol by the June 2013 RPI figure of 1.5% and not” there should be substituted the words “£1,254,000 by not increasing duty on all categories of alcohol”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 15**

Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**CONTRE: 33**

Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator P.M. Bailhache  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of Grouville

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)

Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)  
 Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)

### Changes in Presidency

The Deputy Bailiff briefly retired from the Chamber during consideration of the amendment of Deputy Sean Seamus Patrick Augustine Power of St. Brelade (P.122/2013 (Amendment 2)(Amendment)) and the meeting continued under the presidency of Mr. Michael Nelson de la Haye, Greffier of the States, until his return.

### Draft Budget Statement 2014 P.122/2013

THE STATES resumed consideration of the Draft Budget Statement 2014 (P.122/2013), and rejected paragraph (ii) of an amendment of Deputy Sean Seamus Patrick Augustine Power of St. Brelade (P.122/2013 (Amendment 2)(Amendment)) to the amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier, that for the words “£866,000 by increasing duty on all tobacco products by 4.5% (being the June 2013 RPI figure of 1.5% plus 3%) and not” there should be substituted the words “£1,466,000 by not increasing duty on tobacco”.

Members present voted as follows –

#### **POUR: 8**

Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)

#### **CONTRE: 40**

Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator P.M. Bailhache  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence

#### **ABSTAIN: 0**

Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)  
 Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)

THE STATES rejected paragraph (iii) of an amendment of Deputy Sean Seamus Patrick Augustine Power of St. Brelade (P.122/2013 (Amendment 2)(Amendment)) to the amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier, that for the words “£100,000 by increasing duty on fuel by the June 2013 RPI figure of 1.5% and not” there should be substituted the words “£399,000 by not increasing duty on fuel”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 22**

Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen

**CONTRE: 26**

Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator P.M. Bailhache  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of Grouville

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)	Deputy of Grouville
Deputy M. Tadier (B)	Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)	Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)	Deputy of Trinity
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)	Deputy S. Pitman (H)
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)	Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)	Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
Deputy J.H. Young (B)	Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
Deputy of St. Mary	Deputy of St. John
	Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
	Deputy of St. Martin
	Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)
	Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)

THE STATES, adopting an amendment of the Minister for Treasury and Resources (P.122/2013 Amendment (2) Amendment (2)) to the amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier to paragraph (a) of the Budget Statement 2014, agreed that for paragraph (i) there should be substituted the following paragraph –

- “(i) by the amounts shown below by amending duties on alcohol for the items listed below in the following manner and not as proposed in the Draft Budget Statement –
- (A) increasing the duty on wines by 3.6% (a decrease of £101,000);
  - (B) increasing the duty on beers and ciders exceeding 2.8% abv but not exceeding 4.9% abv by 3% (a decrease of £85,000);
  - (C) introducing a new lower band of duty on beers and ciders exceeding 1.2% abv but not exceeding 2.8% abv (a nil decrease), with this new band of duty being calculated at 50% of the duty rate for beers in the 2.8% abv but not exceeding 4.9% abv band;”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 25**

Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator P.M. Bailhache  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy of Trinity

**CONTRE: 23**

Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)	Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)	Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)	Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
Deputy of St. John	Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)
Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)	Deputy J.H. Young (B)
Deputy of St. Mary	Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)
Deputy of St. Martin	
Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)	

THE STATES, having resumed consideration of an amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier (P.122/2013 (Amendment 2)) as amended, agreed that in paragraph (a) of the Budget Statement 2014, after the words “as set out in the Budget Statement” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the estimate of income from taxation during 2014 shall be decreased –

- (i) by the amounts shown below by amending duties on alcohol for the items listed below in the following manner and not as proposed in the Draft Budget Statement –
- (A) increasing the duty on wines by 3.6% (a decrease of £101,000);
- (B) increasing the duty on beers and ciders exceeding 2.8% abv but not exceeding 4.9% abv by 3% (a decrease of £85,000);
- (C) introducing a new lower band of duty on beers and ciders exceeding 1.2% abv but not exceeding 2.8% abv (a nil decrease), with this new band of duty being calculated at 50% of the duty rate for beers in the 2.8% abv but not exceeding 4.9% abv band;”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 40**

Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator P.M. Bailhache  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)

**CONTRE: 2**

Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Deputy of St. Mary

**ABSTAIN: 5**

Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)

Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)  
 Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)

THE STATES rejected paragraph (ii) of an amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier that in paragraph (a) of the Budget Statement 2014, after the words “as set out in the Budget Statement” there should be inserted the words “except that the estimate of income from taxation during 2014 shall be decreased by £866,000 by increasing duty on all tobacco products by 4.5% (being the June 2013 RPI figure of 1.5% plus 3%) and not by 11% as proposed in the Draft Budget Statement”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 16**

Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)  
 Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)

**CONTRE: 32**

Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator P.M. Bailhache  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)

**ABSTAIN: 0**



Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Mary

THE STATES, adopting paragraph (iii) of an amendment of the Connétable of St. Helier, agreed that in paragraph (a) of the Budget Statement 2014, after the words “as set out in the Budget Statement” there should be inserted the words “except that the estimate of income from taxation during 2014 shall be decreased by £100,000 by increasing duty on fuel by the June 2013 RPI figure of 1.5% and not by 2% as proposed in the Draft Budget Statement”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 31**

Senator A. Breckon  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy R.G. Bryans (H)  
 Deputy R.J. Rondel (H)

**CONTRE: 16**

Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley  
 Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator P.M. Bailhache  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin

**ABSTAIN: 1**

Connétable of St. Mary

**Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Thursday 5th December 2013 to continue consideration of the Budget Statement 2014 (P.122/2013) as amended and the outstanding items of public business.

THE STATES rose at 5.24 p.m.

**M.N. DE LA HAYE**

*Greffier of the States*